Tornadoes: How unusual was 2011?

Jim Maher, CFA, FCAS, MAAA Chief Risk Officer Platinum Underwriters Reinsurance, Inc.

October, 2012



2011 Tornado/Hail Losses (PCS)

- Aggregate losses = \$26 BN
 - Approx. 300 year Return Period in Cat Model X
 - Cat model X expected average annual loss = \$10 BN
- 5 events > \$1 BN (pre 2011 avg. is 1.3 events/yr)
 - CAT 46 (4/22-28) = \$7.3 BN
 - CAT 48 (5/20-28) = \$6.9 BN
 - Cat 42 (4/3-5) = \$2.0 BN
 - CAT 43 (4/8-14) = \$1.5 BN
 - CAT 44 (4/14-16) = \$1.4 BN

- Insured loss
- Number of tornadoes
- Severity of tornadoes (Fujita scale)
- Number of fatalities
 - 553 fatalities in 2011 and 5,370 injuries

Number of tornadoes



liminary tornadoes from Local Storm Reports multiplied by 0.85 to remove overc *See http://www.spc.noaa.gov/wcm/adj.html for details.

Enhanced Fujita Scale

Scale	Wind speed (Estimated) ^[3]		Example of damage	Relative frequency	Average Damage Path Width	Potential da
	mph	km/h		[chailon needed]	(meters) [citation needed]	
EF0	65–85	105–137		38.9%	10–50	Light damage. Some damage to chimneys; branches broken off trees; shallow-rooted trees pushed over; sign boards damaged.
EF1	86–110	138–178		35.6%	30–150	The lower limit is the beginning of hurricane wind speed; peels surface off roofs; mobile homes pushed off foundations or overturned; moving autos pushed off the roads; attached garages may be destroyed.
EF2	111–135	179–218		19.4%	110-250	Significant damage. Roofs torn off frame houses; mobile homes demolished; boxcars overturned; large trees snapped or uprooted; highrise windows broken and blown in; light-object missiles generated.
EF3	136–165	219–266		4.9%	200–500	Severe damage. Roofs and some walls torn off well-constructed houses; trains overturned; most trees in forest uprooted; heavy cars lifted off the ground and thrown.
EF4	166–200	267–322	A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A	1.1%	400–900	Devastating damage. Well-constructed houses leveled; structures with weak foundations blown away some distance; cars thrown and large missiles generated.
EF5	>200	>322		<0.1%	1100 ~	Incredible damage. Strong frame houses lifted off foundations and carried considerable distances to disintegrate: automobile sized missiles fly through the air in excess of 100 m (109 yd); trees debarked; steel reinforced concrete structures badly damaged.

2011 ranks 3rd after 1974 and 1965 based on number of strong-to-violent tornadoes



Number of Strong to Violent (EF-3 to EF-5) U.S. Tornadoes, 1950 - 2011 Tornado death rate declining but 2011 stands out



US Tornado Deaths/Million People



1974 Super Outbreak



2011 Tornadoes-insured loss

- 2011 tornado/hail experience stands out from
 - Number of large events (5 events > \$1 BN)
 - Total aggregate loss of \$26 BN
- How do these losses compare to
 - Trended historical experience?
 - Cat model X output?
 - For individual events?
 - For the year as a whole?

US Tornado/Hail Historical Losses

- Period selected 1972-2011 (i.e. 40 years)
 - source ISO PCS database
 - Trend using nominal GDP growth
 - Includes inflation
 - And "real" growth in economy- proxy for property exposure growth
 - Extra 2% added to account for "social inflation"

Tornado/Hail: 2011 looks extreme compared to previous years



Tornado Hail: Aggregate Losses by year

CAS SIS Cats 2012 Maher

- Initial trend based on nominal GDP
 - Allows for both inflation and real exposure growth
- But material residual trend of 3.81%
- Social inflation?
- Look at housing stock data

Annual Growth in value of Housing stock: 1990-2011 = 4.2%



1990 1991 1992 1993 1994 1995 1996 1997 1998 1999 2000 2001 2002 2003 2004 2005 2006 2007 2008 2009 2010 2011



Nominal GDP

CAS SIS Cats 2012 Maher

Trend at GDP +2% to eliminate residual trend (social inflation?)



16

Comparison to Cat Model X return period curve (Exced freq = 1/RP)



US Tornado/Hail Peril: Occurrence Losses

AIR return periods for Super Outbreak events (based on size of loss)

- 1974 Super Outbreak:
 - Cat Model X return period = 48 years
- 2011 Super Outbreak:
 - Cat Model X return period = 23 years
- May 2011 event:
 - Cat Model X return period = 20 years
- What are the odds of having two 20+ year events in the same year?
 - based upon a poisson distribution (doesn't allow for clustering) probability is 0.12%

- not likely to be true probability- i.e. we must take event clustering into account





- Cat Model X says it is a 300 year period year.
- Again perhaps not likely to be true
- Empirical return period: 40 years
- Power curve fit (green line) return period: 40 years